

Annexure D

Summary of Submissions

Comments Noted in Support

- Diversification of the local economy
- Efficient utilisation of local resources
- The area has been identified for this use
- Support for use of rail as primary means of transport
- Need good high quality NZ product – when compared to imported product
- Waitaki needs a vibrant industrial sector
- Consistent supply of quality cement is of national importance – e.g. infrastructure projects
- Increase in jobs in area,
- Benefit to local economy through increase in employment opportunities
- Social and community benefits to Weston and Oamaru
- Increases in population will increase interaction with other organisations, such as sporting clubs, social clubs etc
- Opposed to inaccurate information from opposition to application
- Represents continuation of historical associations of North Otago with limestone quarries and other industrial activities.

Comments on Economic Matters (In Opposition)

- Economic impact on Westport and Buller region from the closure of the Holcim plant there
- Upgrading Westport plant has less environmental effects
- Existing plant at Westport is economic and viable, has the infrastructure to support upgrade without the effects that could occur in Weston
- Economic impacts for local economy do not stack up
- Adverse economic impact on existing businesses with varying industries – agriculture, wine, organics, tourism. Effects related to perception of activity and also to actual

outputs – emissions and results they may have on soil quality, water quality, etc.

- Oppose to use of local resources for overseas profits – money will not be staying in district
- Independent economic assessment needs to be undertaken
- Devaluation of area as tourist destination – goes against clean green image
- Adverse impact on property values
- The degree scale and impact of this project will necessarily and predictably introduce hitherto unknown degrees of deprivation into the North Otago community
- Potential impact on people speculating in rental property market for construction workers
- Employment opportunities created are not necessarily the right ones – these are mainly labouring positions

Comments on Planning Matters

- Outline plan for reinstatement of railway on designated land – could have been explained better by Holcim – not sure if many people understood this.
- Against the aims and purpose of the Resource Management Act
- Doesn't meet policies in District Plan
- Storage of hazardous substances
- Granting of consent will not impact on the ability to use property for residential purposes
- Unsustainable use of resources – using good arable land
- Hours of operation
- Not in keeping with the Cement Policy Area – too large
- Inappropriate activity in a rural area, is not industrial zone
- Scale of the development is inappropriate
- Proposal will have adverse effects on the environment
- Changing District Plan to 'fit' this proposal (Variation 4), raises questions of objectivity of decision making.
- Lack of alternatives considered

- General concern over Variation 4 and the application
- Issues between Variation 2, Variation 4 and application
- Loss of amenity for the school, play centre, church, girl guides, Weston Hall users
- Description of lighting of the plant at night is inadequate, no visualisation provided
- Effects of ‘peak production’ have not been examined. Peak production could occur over a long period for large-scale construction projects. Assessments of effects should reflect this or there should be maximum daily production limit.
- Adverse impact on rural amenity values
- Sensitivity of the receiving environment has not been taken into account
- Restoration of sites including the plant site needs to be taken into account

Comments on Heritage/Archaeological Matters

- Degradation of local buildings due to sulphuric acid
- Incompatible with the heritage and environmental nature of Oamaru
- Impact of granting application on World Heritage Site application to Oamaru
- Protection required for geological fossils found in quarries
- Will adversely affect relationship of Maori with ancestral lands and waahi tapu
- Oamaru Run 15 – Whitstone Woods in process of seeking historic registration, the true extent of site is not known and needs exploring and incorporating into landscape proposal
- Historic stone building located at base of escarpment – needs Conservation Plan, and issues addressed such as stability from vibration
- Opposed to use of rail, as historic stone building site on edge of siding and will be put at risk from heavy transport
- Concern on impact to rock art and the proposals to preserve it
- Impact on historic/archaeological sites – European sites include Ngapara Branch railway, stone walls, James Hassel’s 1860 homestead site; Maori
- Impact of plant on the historic character of the valley and hence the setting of historic homesteads

Comments on Landscape/Visual Matters

- General concern on the visual impacts of the whole proposal
- Visual impact of the plume
- Size of plant and height of stack are visually intrusive
- Concern with level of visual pollution from proposal
- Adverse effects on scenic environment
- Destroy the beauty and peace of Weston and surrounding environment
- Windsor-Ngapara Road – significant scenic/tourist route
- Negative impact on natural landscape
- Proposal not sympathetic to a rural landscape
- General concern over impact of quarrying on landscape
- Impact on Whitestone escarpment
- Limestone escarpment from Kakanui to Duntroon including Waireki Valley is a significant natural landscape that must be protected
- Noise mitigation bunding and stormwater containment area planting are key mitigation measures between plant and property
- Plant will negatively impact on landscape and can not be mitigated
- Factory is in direct line of sight, and 3 times bigger than planned – 1km from house
- Views of Kakanui mountains will be impacted on
- Earth-bunding and planting will provide no protection for views from Springhill Road
- Visual impact of tuff quarry
- Night sky pollution – visual impact of plant at night
- Oamaru Run 15 – Whitestone Woods in process of seeking historic registration, the true extent of site is not known and needs exploring and incorporating into landscape proposal

Comments on Recreation Matters

- Loss of cycling track on old train track – requires replacement walking track
- Degradation of local rock climbing crag – ‘Elephant Rocks’

Comments on Traffic Matters

- Increase in traffic, particularly heavy vehicle traffic generally
- Increase in traffic, particularly heavy vehicle traffic in Weston
- Increase in train movements
- Degradation of roads generally through heavy vehicle use
- Safety issues on narrow roads through Weston, Windsor, Ngapara and Enfield
- Increase in heavy vehicles (trucks) on school bus route – safety issue
- Kia Ora Rd/Weston-Ngapara Road intersection will become more dangerous
- By-pass needed from Limeworks to Whiterocks Road
- Increased traffic congestion from railway use
- Safety issues associated with truck movements and access to Weston Church
- Windsor Road too narrow, has blind curve; Peaks Road, bridge strengthening will be required
- Safety issues on Weston-Ngapara Road for cyclists, pedestrians, school buses, and access to houses
- Safety issues - off-camber corners, no verges outside property, therefore nowhere to go if needed.
- Oppose to use of public roads for this activity – should be more rail use
- Safety concerns associated with Weston School, school bus routes, playcentre from the increasing traffic and particularly heavy vehicles
- Design of entrance to plant doesn't assess safety risk, undulating nature already incurred 'no-passing' lines. Safety of other users of this stretch of road needs to be taken into consideration. Road needs levelling and widening for acceleration lanes at entrance in both directions.
- Speed limit on roads needs looking at
- Five Folks intersection, and Whitestone Woods – visibility issue now, increase in heavy vehicle traffic will make this worse
- Train use puts heritage buildings at risk from vibration
- Victoria Hill Road oppose sandpit – issues with this, Holcim stated they wouldn't use it; roads too narrow

- Windsor Road too narrow
- Concern from residents of Airedale Road regarding increase heavy vehicle traffic and safety issues for pedestrians and other road users, speed of vehicles and accessing their sites
- Unable to ascertain actual effects as the preferred routes are not stated
- Concern over increase of traffic on Peaks/Windsor Road
- Safety concerns with railway crossings due to increase in train movements – Severn Street, Thames Street, SH1 level crossing
- Consider that traffic movements with mining operations may be too conservative – Holcim need to be part of the road surface and structure maintenance due to increase of heavy vehicles on these roads
- Assessment does not take into account impact on Kai Ora Rd and issues associated with aggregate needed over construction of railway and road upgrading
- Impact of increased truck use of roads on recreational users – cyclists, horse riders
- Whiterocks Road dangerous due to dips
- Impact of increased truck use of roads on farming users – e.g. movement of stock
- Concern over Main Street/Weston-Ngapara Road – particularly near school, route should be moved

Comments On Noise

- Issue with noise from trucks and trains
- Issue with noise from conveyor belt, plant, quarry and construction going 24 hours
- General issue of increased noise pollution
- Concern with noise from train near home
- Noise effects on property – mitigation required
- Noise levels greater than permitted for zone
- Noise associated with rebuilding of railway and upgrading of roads not taken into account = loss of amenity
- Noise from the Tuff quarry
- Impact of noise on Enfield and Weston Churches
- Noise issues associated with school,

- General concern of impact of noise on schools and play centres

Comments On Other Matters

- Accommodation of construction work force – where? Impacts of demand for housing
- Location is too close to the town and to the schools – 2 schools and 4 play centres within 4km radius
- Location of plant – shift to near coalmine – results in efficiency in transportation.
- No new open cast mines. Plenty locally with lower sulphur levels
- Opposed to use of coal and used oil
- Holcim's track record for complying with emission levels
- Adverse effect on quality of life
- Proposal will destroy existing ecosystems
- Concern over the health risks
- Concern over the potential for air, soil and water contamination
- Location is too close to the town and the school
- Water source from plant – where will this come from?
- Proposal will discourage people to move to Oamaru
- Whitestone Bluffs form the gateway to the Fossil Trail
- Goes against the Kyoto Protocol
- Impact of Ngapara mine on quality of life
- Impact of sandpit on creek running through property
- Shift the plant to Ngapara