#### BEFORE THE ENVIRONMENT COURT

<u>IN THE MATTER</u> of the Resource Management Act 1991

AND of an appeal under clause 14 of the First

Schedule of the Act

<u>BETWEEN</u> CONTACT ENERGY LIMITED

(ENV-2015-CHC-8)

<u>Appellant</u>

AND OTAGO REGIONAL COUNCIL

Respondent

Environment Judge J R Jackson sitting alone pursuant to section 279 of the Act

In Chambers at Christchurch

#### **CONSENT ORDER**

- [A] Under section 279(1)(b) of the Resource Management Act 1991, the Environment Court, by consent, <u>orders</u> that:
  - (1) the appeal is allowed to the extent that the Otago Regional Council is directed to amend Plan Change 4C as set out in Schedule 1, attached to and forming part of this order;
  - (2) the appeal is otherwise dismissed.
- [B] Under section 285 of the Resource Management Act 1991, there is no order as to costs.

#### REASONS

#### Introduction

[1] This proceeding concerns an appeal by Contact Energy Limited against a decision of the Otago Regional Council on Proposed Plan Change 4C (Groundwater Management: Cromwell Terrace Aquifer) to the Regional Plan: Water for Otago.



[2] The court has now read and considered the consent memorandum of the parties dated 20 May 2015, which proposes to resolve the appeal.

#### Other relevant matters

[3] Horticulture New Zealand and Federated Farmers of New Zealand (Inc) have given notice of an intention to become parties under section 274 of the Resource Management Act 1991 ("the RMA") and have signed the memorandum setting out the relief sought.

#### **Orders**

[4] The court is making this order under section 279(1)(b) of the RMA, that is the order is made by consent and is not a decision or determination on the merits pursuant to section 290. The court understands for present purposes that:

- (a) all parties to the proceedings have executed the memorandum requesting this order;
- (b) all parties are satisfied that all matters proposed for the court's endorsement fall within the court's jurisdiction, and achieves the relevant requirements and the purpose of the RMA including, in particular, Part 2;
- (c) all parties are satisfied that all matters proposed for the court's endorsement give effect to the National Policy Statement on Freshwater Management 2014 and the National Policy Statement on Renewable Electricity Generation 2011.

DATED at Christchurch

May 2015

J R Jackson

Environment Judge

Issued: 2 7 MAY 2015 2015-chc-8 contact v orc consent order

# Proposed Plan Change 4C (Groundwater management: Cromwell Terrace Aquifer)

# Regional Plan: Water for Otago

#### **Incorporating Decisions of Council**

Note: All amendments to text in this Plan resulting from Proposed Plan Change 4C (Groundwater management: Cromwell Terrace Aquifer) as notified, and incorporating Council Decisions, are shown with additions <u>underlined</u> and deletions <del>struckout.</del>

All amendments to the decisions version that result from Environment Court mediation are shown in red text with additions <u>underlined</u> and deletions <del>struckout</del>.

On 17 May 2014, Proposed Plan Change 4B (Groundwater allocation) to the Regional Plan: Water for Otago was notified. Changes to the Operative Water Plan made by Proposed Plan Change 4B (Groundwater allocation) are shown in this document in *italics*.

Modified from 13 December 2014 ISBN 978-0-478-37698-2



29 April 2015

Decisions of Council on Proposed Plan Change 4C (Groundwater management: Cromwell Terrace Aquifer) to the Regional Plan: Water for Otago, showing amendments agreed at Environment Court mediation

29 April 2015



#### **Table of Contents**

Ref 1Schedule 4 (page 20-65 of plan)	. 3
u b ı /	
Ref 2Minor and consequential changes	. 4



## SCHEDULE 4: SPECIFIED RESTRICTIONS ON THE EXERCISE OF PERMITS TO TAKE GROUNDWATER

## 4. Schedule of specified restrictions on the exercise of permits to take groundwater

This schedule sets out restrictions that apply to the taking of groundwater from certain aquifers in Otago.

Schedule 4A identifies maximum allocation limits for the taking of groundwater from aquifers indentified in the C-series maps, in accordance with Policy 6.4.10A(a)(i) of this Plan. Schedule 4B identifies water levels at which the taking of groundwater will be restricted in accordance with Policy 6.4.10A(b) of this Plan. Schedule 4C identifies matters to be considered when making additions to these schedules through a plan change.

#### 4A Maximum allocation limits for groundwater takes from aquifers

Aquifer Name	Map Reference	Maximum Allocation Limit (million cubic metres per year)
Cromwell Terrace Aquifer	<u>C3</u>	<u>4</u>
North Otago Volcanic Aquifer	C10	7

#### 4B Restrictions levels for groundwater takes

#### 4B.1 Restriction levels for groundwater takes

Schedule 4B identifies water levels at which the taking of groundwater will be restricted, and identifies the nature of the restriction, in terms of a reduction in the take of water authorised by water permits.

The aquifer maximum height refers to the historic record of the water level or pressure head after the recharge season. Note that the areas over which the restrictions apply are shown on Maps D1 - D4.

	Aquifer Aquifer maximum		Restriction levels (m above mean sea level)			
Aquifer See Maps D1–D4	Reference Bore See Maps D1– D4	height (metres above datum)	25% restriction or response in terms of Council recognised rationing regime*	50% Restriction	100% restriction	
North Otago Volcanic	Websters Well	130.8	126.0	125.5	125.0	
Lower Taieri – West	Momona Bore	101.24	100	99.5	99	
Lower Taieri – East	Harleys Well, Piezo. 2	112.5	112.5		109.5	
Ettrick Basin	Calder Bore	172.29	170.29	169.79	169.29	
Roxburgh Basin (Coal Creek Terrace)	White-Hall Bore	189.5	188	187.8	187.5	

\* When the aquifer reaches this level there shall be either a 25% restriction or a water allocation committee, appointed by the Otago Regional Council, will implement a protocol to take all practical steps to curb the decline in the aquifer level so as to avoid a 50% restriction. If there is no water allocation committee or

Decisions of Council on Proposed Plan Change 4C (Groundwater management: Cromwell Terrace Aquifer) to the Regional Plan: Water for Otago, showing amendments agreed at Environment Court mediation

Page 3



HE SEAL OF

the water allocation committee does not use a protocol approved by the Council, the 25% water restriction will apply.

#### 4B.2 Restrictions for Cromwell Terrace Aquifer

There shall be no takes from the Cromwell Terrace Aquifer for irrigation purposes between 1 May and 31 August inclusive in each year.

Because the Cromwell Terrace Aquifer is hydraulically connected to Lake Dunstan, other restrictions may be imposed on resource consents to take water, to help maintain lake levels.



#### Table of minor and consequential changes

Plan Provision	Detail of proposed change				
Page numbers	Update page numbers.				
Footers	Change footer to read "Reg be inserted>)".	gional Plan: W	ater for Otago (I	Updated to <date< td=""><td>e to</td></date<>	e to
Title page	Change the date to read "U	pdated to <da< td=""><td>te to be inserted</td><td>&gt;".</td><td></td></da<>	te to be inserted	>".	
ISBN number	Obtain new ISBN numbers	for Regional	Plan: Water for	Otago.	
Table of Contents	Update the Table of Conter	nts &Table of	Contents for Sch	nedules 1 to 16	
Chronicle of key events	Add the following to the en	d of table:			
	Key event	Date notified	Date decisions released	Date operative	
	Plan Change 4C (Groundwater management: Cromwell Terrace Aquifer) to the Regional Plan: Water	16 August 2014	13 December 2014	<date be="" inserted="" to=""></date>	
section 1.4	Proposed Plan Change 4C (Groundwater management: Cromwell Terrace Aquifer) sets a maximum allocation limit for the Cromwell Terrace Aquifer. It was notified on Saturday 16 August 2014, and a total of 8 submissions and 3 further submissions were received. Following the hearing, decisions on submissions received were released on 13 December 2014. Plan Change 4C was made operative on <date be="" inserted="" to="">.</date>				
Policy 6.4.10A1	Amend as follows:  Enable the taking of water allocated as groundwater by Policy 6.4.1A, by:  (a) Determining the volume available for taking as the maximum allocation limit less the assessed maximum annual take for an aquifer calculated using Method 15.8.3.1; and  (b) Applying aquifer restrictions levels where specified in Schedule 4B.				
Policy 6.4.10AB	Amend as follows:  To define restrictions levels where needed to protect aquifer properties and water storage.				
OF 17/4	Explanation Groundwater restriction le	evels can be u	seful for protect	ing an aquifer fr	om

Decisions of Council on Proposed Plan Change 4C (Groundwater management: Cromwell Terrace Aquifer) to the Regional Plan: Water for Otago, showing amendments agreed at Environment Court mediation

THE SEA

Plan Provision	Detail of proposed change			
	over-depletion due to extended periods of low recharge, or in managing localised areas of high demand. They can assist in avoiding land subsidence, aquifer compression, reduced outflows to surface water, and sustaining the life supporting capacity of the aquifer. Near the coast or contaminated sites restrictions can minimise the potential for water quality effects by intrusion.			
	Restrictions—levels are listed in Schedule 4B, and new aquifers may be added to the schedule using the plan change process.			
	Schedule 4C.2 provides detail of the matters that may be considered when setting restriction levels.			
	Principal reasons for adopting This policy is adopted to enable the taking of groundwater while assisting to maintain groundwater levels and water storage, water quality, aquifer interaction with other water bodies, and avoiding aquifer compression			
12.2.3.2A	Amend as follows:			
	Except as provided for by 12.0.1.3, 12.2.1A.3 and 12.2.3.1A, the taking and use of groundwater is a restricted discretionary activity, if:			
	(a) The volume sought is within:			
	(i) The maximum allocation limit identified in Schedule 4A; or			
	(ii) 50% of the mean annual recharge calculated under Schedule 4D, for any aquifer not identified in Schedule 4A; or			
	(iii) That volume specified in an existing resource consent where the assessed maximum annual take of the aquifer exceeds its maximum allocation limit; and			
	(b) It is subject to any aquifer restriction level identified in Schedule 4B; and			
	(c) Where the rate of surface water depletion is greater than 5 l/s, as calculated using Schedule 5A:			
	(i) Primary surface water allocation is available; and			
	(ii) For the <u>Waitaki catchment</u> , allocation to activities set out in Table 12.1.4.2 is available.			
	The matters to which the Otago Regional Council has restricted the exercise of its discretion are set out in Rule 12.2.3.4.			
12.2.3.4	Amend as follows:			
- U <sub>F</sub> / <sub>A</sub>	Restricted discretionary activity considerations In considering any resource consent for the taking and use of groundwater in terms of Rule 12.2.3.2A, the Otago Regional Council will restrict the			



Plan Provision	Detail of proposed change			
A A O VASAOAR	exercise of its discretion to the following:			
	(i) The maximum allocation volume for the aquifer; and			
	(ii) The mean annual recharge of that aquifer; and			
	(iii) The effect of the take on the hydrodynamic properties of the aquifer and the vulnerability of the aquifer to compaction			
	(iv) Whether any part of the take would constitute allocation from any connected perennial surface water body, and the availability of the allocation; and			
	<ul><li>(v) The rate, volume, timing and frequency of groundwater to be taker and used; and</li></ul>			
	(vi) The proposed methods of take, delivery and application of the groundwater taken; and			
	(vii) The source of groundwater available to be taken; and			
	(viii) The location of the use of the groundwater, when it will be taken out of a local catchment; and			
	(ix) In the case of takes from an aquifer identified in Schedule 4B, the restriction-levels for the aquifer (as identified in that schedule) to be applied to the take of groundwater, if consent is granted; and			
Schedule 4	Amend as follows:			
	Schedule 4A identifies maximum allocation limits for the taking of groundwater from aquifers indentified in the C-series maps, in accordance with Policy 6.4.10A(a)(i) of this Plan. Schedule 4B identifies water levels at which the taking of groundwater will be restricted in accordance with Policy 6.4.10A(b) of this Plan. Schedule 4C identifies matters to be considered when making additions to these schedules through a plan change.			
Schedule 4B.1	Replace the words "(m above mean sea level)" with "(metres above datum)" under the heading "Restriction levels" as follows:			
	Aquifer See Maps D1— D4 Aquifer Reference Bore See Maps D4 D4 Restriction levels (metres above datum above mean-sea-level)  Restriction levels (metres above datum above mean-sea-level)  25% restriction or response in terms of Council recognised rationing regime*  Restriction levels (metres above datum above mean-sea-level)  100% restriction			
Class	A manual share definitions of determs on fall arms			
Glossary	Amend the definition of datum as follows:  Datum The fixed level for basing subsequent level			

Decisions of Council on Proposed Plan Change 4C (Groundwater management: Cromwell Terrace Aquifer) to the Regional Plan: Water for Otago, showing amendments agreed at Environment Court mediation

THE SEA

Plan Provision	Detail of proposed change
	measurements, in this case datum means Otago Metric Datum, which is the Dunedin Vertical Datum (DVD 1958) plus 100 metres below mean sea level.



### Appendix 2

# Plan Change 4C (Groundwater management: Cromwell Terrace Aquifer)

Regional Plan: Water for Otago

Operative version

ISBN 978-0-908324-09-5





This is a true and correct copy of Plan Change 4C to the Regional Plan: Water for Otago which was approved by the resolution of the Otago Regional Council on Wednesday, 5 August 2015.

Plan Change 4C to the Regional Plan: Water is deemed to be operative on Tuesday, 1 September 2015.

The Common Seal of the Otago Regional Council was hereto affixed pursuant to the resolution of the Council passed on Wednesday, 5 August 2015 in the presence of:

Stephen Woodhead Chairperson

**Peter Bodeker Chief Executive** 



#### Table of Contents

Ref 1 Schedule 4 (page 20-65 of plan)	3
Ref 2 Minor and consequential changes	4

#### 4. Schedule of the allocation and restriction regime for groundwater

This schedule sets out restrictions that apply to the taking of groundwater from certain aquifers in Otago.

Schedule 4A identifies maximum allocation limits for the taking of groundwater from aquifers indentified in the C-series maps, in accordance with Policy 6.4.10A2 of this Plan. Schedule 4B identifies water levels at which the taking of groundwater will be restricted in accordance with Policy 6.4.10A1(b) of this Plan. Schedule 4C identifies matters to be considered when making additions to these schedules through a plan change.

#### 4A Maximum allocation limits for groundwater takes from aquifers

Aquifer Name	Map Reference Maximum Allocation Li (million cubic metres per	
Cromwell Terrace Aquifer	C7	4
North Otago Volcanic Aquifer	C10	7

#### 4B Restrictions for groundwater takes

#### **4B.1** Restriction levels for groundwater takes

Schedule 4B.1 identifies water levels at which the taking of groundwater will be restricted, and identifies the nature of the restriction, in terms of a reduction in the take of water authorised by water permits.

The aquifer maximum height refers to the historic record of the water level or pressure head after the recharge season. Note that the areas over which the restrictions apply are shown on Maps D1 - D4.

	Aquifer	Aquifer	Restriction levels (m above mean sea level)			
Aquifer See Maps D1–D4	Reference Bore See Maps D1– D4	maximum height (metres above datum)	25% restriction or response in terms of Council recognised rationing regime*	50% restriction	100% restriction	
North Otago Volcanic	Websters Well	130.8	126.0	125.5	125.0	
Lower Taieri – West	Momona Bore	101.24	100	99.5	99	
Lower Taieri – East	Harleys Well, Piezo. 2	112.5	110.5	110.0	109.5	
Ettrick Basin	Calder Bore	172.29	170.29	169.79	169.29	
Roxburgh Basin (Coal Creek Terrace)	White-Hall Bore	189.5	188	187.8	187.5	

\* When the aquifer reaches this level there shall be either a 25% restriction or a water allocation committee, appointed by the Otago Regional Council, will implement a protocol to take all practical steps to curb the decline in the aquifer level so as to avoid a 50% restriction. If there is no water allocation committee or the water allocation committee does not use a protocol approved by the Council,

the 25% water restriction will apply.

#### **4B.2** Restrictions for Cromwell Terrace Aquifer

There shall be no takes from the Cromwell Terrace Aquifer for irrigation purposes between 1 May and 31 August inclusive in each year.

Because the Cromwell Terrace Aquifer is hydraulically connected to Lake Dunstan, other restrictions may be imposed on resource consents to take water, to help maintain lake levels.

#### Table of minor and consequential changes

Plan Provision	Detail of proposed change			
Page numbers	Update page numbers.			
Page referencing	Update all references to page nu	umbers throu	ghout the plan.	
Footers	Change footer to read "Regional September 2015)".	ıl Plan: Water	for Otago (Upd	ated to 1
Title page	Change the date to read "Updat	ed to 1 Septe	mber 2015".	
ISBN number	Obtain new ISBN numbers for Regional Plan: Water for Otago	_	n: Water for Ota	go, and
Chronicle of key events	Add the following to the end of	table:		
	Key event	Date notified	Date decisions released	Date operative
	Plan Change 4C (Groundwater management: Cromwell Terrace Aquifer) to the Regional Plan: Water	16 August 2014	13 December 2014	1 September 2015
section 1.4	Add the following text:  Proposed Plan Change 4C (Groundwater management: Cromwell Terrace Aquifer) sets a maximum allocation limit for the Cromwell Terrace Aquifer. It was notified on Saturday 16 August 2014, and a total of 8 submissions and 3 further submissions were received. Following the hearing, decisions on submissions received were released on 13 December 2014. Plan Change 4C was made operative on 1 September 2015.			
Policy 6.4.10A1	Amend as follows:  Enable the taking of wate 6.4.1A, by:  (a) Determining the volumallocation limit less the aquifer calculated usin (b) Applying aquifer restreation 4B.	ne available e assessed n g Method 15	for taking as t naximum annua 5.8.3.1; and	he maximum al take for an

Plan Provision	Detail of proposed change			
Policy	Amend as follows:			
6.4.10AB	To define restrictions levels where needed to protect aquifer properties and water storage.			
	Explanation Groundwater restriction levels can be useful for protecting an aquifer from over-depletion due to extended periods of low recharge, or in managing localised areas of high demand. They can assist in avoiding land subsidence, aquifer compression, reduced outflows to surface water, and sustaining the life supporting capacity of the aquifer. Near the coast or contaminated sites restrictions can minimise the potential for water quality effects by intrusion.			
	Restrictions levels are listed in Schedule 4B, and new aquifers may be added to the schedule using the plan change process.			
	Schedule 4C.2 provides detail of the matters that may be considered when setting restriction levels.			
	Principal reasons for adopting This policy is adopted to enable the taking of groundwater while assisting to maintain groundwater levels and water storage, water quality, aquifer interaction with other water bodies, and avoiding aquifer compression			
12.2.3.2A	Amend as follows:			
	Except as provided for by 12.0.1.3, 12.2.1A.3 and 12.2.3.1A, the taking and use of groundwater is a restricted discretionary activity, if:			
	(a) The volume sought is within:			
	(i) The maximum allocation limit identified in Schedule 4A; or			
	(ii) 50% of the mean annual recharge calculated under Schedule 4D, for any aquifer not identified in Schedule 4A; or			
	(iii) That volume specified in an existing resource consent where the assessed maximum annual take of the aquifer exceeds its maximum allocation limit; and			
	(b) It is subject to any aquifer restriction levels identified in Schedu 4B; and			
	(c) Where the rate of surface water depletion is greater than 5 l/s, as calculated using Schedule 5A:			
	(i) Primary surface water allocation is available; and			
	(ii) For the Waitaki catchment, allocation to activities set out in Table 12.1.4.2 is available.			

Plan Provision	Detail	Detail of proposed change					
		The matters to which the Otago Regional Council has restricted the exercise of its discretion are set out in Rule 12.2.3.4.					
12.2.3.4	Amend as follows:  Restricted discretionary activity considerations In considering any resource consent for the taking and use of groundw in terms of Rule 12.2.3.2A, the Otago Regional Council will restrict the exercise of its discretion to the following:						
	(i)	The maximum allocation limit for the aquifer; and					
	(iA)	The assessed maximum annual take for the aquifer; and					
	(ii)	The mean annual recharge of the aquifer; and					
	(iii)	The effect of the take on the hydrodynamic properties of the aquifer and the vulnerability of the aquifer to compaction; and					
	(iv)	Whether any part of the take would constitute allocation from any connected perennial surface water body, and the availability of that allocation; and					
	(v)	The rate, volume, timing and frequency of groundwater to be taken and used; and					
	(vi)	The proposed methods of take, delivery and application of the groundwater taken; and					
	(vii)	The source of groundwater available to be taken; and					
	(viii)	The location of the use of the groundwater, when it will be taken out of a local catchment; and					
	(ix)	In the case of takes from an aquifer identified in Schedule 4B, the restrictions levels for the aquifer (as identified in that schedule) to be applied to the take of groundwater, if consent is granted; and					

Plan Provision	Detail of proposed change							
Schedule 4	Amend as follows:							
	Schedule of the allocation and restriction regime for groundwater							
	This schedule sets out restrictions that apply to the taking of groundwater from certain aquifers in Otago.							
	Schedule 4A identifies maximum allocation limits for the taking of groundwater from aquifers indentified in the C-series maps, in accordance with Policy 6.4.10A2 of this Plan. Schedule 4B identifies water levels at which the taking of groundwater will be restricted in accordance with Policy 6.4.10A1(b) of this Plan. Schedule 4C identifies matters to be considered when making additions to these schedules through a plan change.							
Schedule 4B.1	Replace the words "(m above mean sea level)" with "(metres above datum)" under the heading "Restriction levels" as follows:							
	Aquifer	Aquifer Reference Bore See Maps D1– D4	Aquifer maximum height (metres above datum)	Restriction levels (metres above datum above mean sea level)				
	See Maps D1– D4			25% restriction or response in terms of Council recognised rationing regime*	50% <del>R</del> restriction	100% restriction		
Glossary	Amend the definition of datum as follows:							
	The fixed level for basing subsequent level measurements, in this case datum means Otago Metric Datum, which is the Dunedin Vertical Datum (DVD 1958) plus 100 metres below mean sea level.							